Abstract—

A Tale of Two Settler Nationalisms: The Formosan Aborigines and Settler Nationalism in Han Chinese Fiction and Film

Darryl Sterk
University of Toronto

This paper discusses the representation of the Formosan aborigines in Chinese works of film and fiction. I look at how such works became vehicles for Chinese and Taiwanese nationalism. In my discussions I propose comparisons from other settler societies, the 'settler society' being a new framework for research on Taiwanese cultural production. I characterize Chinese and Taiwanese settler nationalism as assimilationist and indigenising respectively. I divide the essay into three parts, based on three modes of narration: homosocial, tutelary, and romance. This framework allows us to consider the implications of different ways of emplotting the nation.

摘要—

雙墾記：論文化生產中的台灣原住民與兩種墾殖民族主義

石岱崙
多倫多大學

本文旨在探討漢人作家/導演將台灣原住民與兩種民族主義—中華/台灣人的民族主義—相提並論。中台民族主義當視為同化／本土化墾殖民族主義兩種，而在小說與影片裡，前者將原住民漢化，後者將漢人原住民化。本文以三個敘事模式來分段：兄弟、師生以及男女敘事，各自有其異族互動的意涵。

A Tale of Two Settler Nationalisms: The Formosan Aborigines and Settler Nationalism in Chinese Fiction and Film[1]

The nationalism the KMT brought to Taiwan after the war was assimilatory. The ideological component of nation-building consisted of a National Language program and a relentlessly Sinocentric perspective in the classroom and the newspaper. The goal was to convert natives and aborigines into Chinese, an endeavor reminiscent of the nationalist project Eugen Weber studied in *Peasants Into Frenchmen*. In Ernest Gellner's theory of nationalism, this kind of national cultural and linguistic homogenization is necessary for industrialization. At any rate, the assimilatory objective was reflected in Chinese films and fictions relating to the Formosan aborigines in postwar Taiwan, which have often become vehicles for the nationalist 'project of civilization' (Harrell, "Civilizing Projects"). For most of the postwar period, the aborigines were called 'mountain compatriots' 山地同胞; until very recently, they were expected to conform to the Chinese cultural norm, for only in the 1980s was the impact of the global reconsideration of the ethics of settlement and of nation-building in a settler society context felt in Taiwan. By the 1980s, some writers and filmmakers had begun to openly challenge the KMT's idea of the nation, and some did so through representations of the aborigines. In some of these challenges, the aborigines are appropriated for Taiwanese nationalism. The politics of representation of the Formosan aborigine is an episode in 'a tale of two settler nationalisms' (see Wang Chao-hua, "A Tale of Two Nationalisms") and an instance of what Scott Simon has called "contested nationalism" ("Taiwan Studies and Taiwanese Indigenous Peoples" 20).

In my discussions, I provide examples of cultural products from other 'settler societies,' the concept of the settler society being the comparative framework of my research: countries like the USA, Canada, Australia, New Zealand, Brazil, and Taiwan, must all grapple with the ethical sequelae of settlement. The political scientist Shi Zhengfeng has described Taiwan as "a typical 'settler society'" 典型的「墾殖社會」(〈原住民政策的定位〉 1), and has argued that "Han people should think harder about how to convince the aborigines to accept this country" (Shi 4). Perhaps 'settler nationalism' can be translated 墾殖民族主義.[2] At any rate, I study Taiwanese film and fiction in this light. In doing so, I am

---

1 This essay is a précis of my doctorate on the postwar filmic and fictional representation of the Formosan aborigines. The title is *Romancing the Formosan Aborigine: Indigenous Romance as National Allegory in Frontier Taiwan*. I have an annotated list of texts at http://individual.utoronto.ca/sterk/formosan.htm. I have presented a conference paper on a related topic, the transformation of Taiwan's landscape in postwar Han Chinese film and fiction, called "Sinifying Taiwan's Territory: Transforming frontier space into Chinese place," the abstract for which is at: http://capiconf.uvic.ca/viewabstract.php?id=199&cf=3. I also have a paper in Chinese called 〈蕃漢婚戀的再現〉 at: http://www.tiprc.org.tw/ePaper/05/05_alan.html. Please send comments to shidailun@gmail.com.

2 Shi Zhengfeng has agreed to my suggestion by e-mail (September 1, 2008).

applying Yvonne Sung-sheng Chang's new agenda "to treat the history of previously marginalized and repressed groups - be they ethnic minorities, women, or colonized people - as a legitimate frame of reference in scholarly research" (22) on cultural production. I borrow the Australian sociologist Anthony Moran's typology of settler nationalism, describing Chinese and Taiwanese nationalism on Taiwan as 'assimilationist' and 'indigenising' respectively (Moran 40; 126-166).[3] That the Formosan aborigine has been caught up in contested nationalism on Taiwan is reminiscent of similar struggles, between Patriots and Confederates in the nineteenth century United States, for instance, which I touch on below in my discussion of the story of Pocahontas. This kind of politics of representation tends to develop in a settler society context.

I divide the films and fictions according to permutations of gender and status into three types of narration: homosocial, tutelary and romantic. It is of course highly problematic to represent national sociodynamics in terms of intimate bourgeois relations, but these are the ways nationalists 'emplot' (Ricoeur, *Time and Narrative*) the nation. In the *The Family Romance of the French Revolution*, for instance, Lynn Hunt shows how Republicans and Royalists debated the future of France in terms of a Freudian model. My division into three types of narration allows us to consider the national implications of different kinds of interethnic relations in film and fiction. In the homosocial narratives, there is a pretence of equality. The Chinese and aboriginal characters are 'friends' in such stories. The unequal relation between Chinese and aborigine is institutionally marked in tutelary narratives. In the tutelary narratives, the Chinese character is typically a teacher and the aboriginal character a student. Finally, hierarchy is naturalized in romantic narratives. In the sections on homosocial and tutelary narratives, I offer a critical introduction to the two most important Chinese stories about the Formosan aborigines in postwar Taiwan: Wu Sha and Wu Feng. The romances are more interesting but less well known, except for the film *The Second Spring of Old Mo* 老莫的第二個春天.

1. Homosocial Narration

The famous Americanist Leslie Fiedler notoriously identified a theme of inter-'racial' homosocial (*Love and Death* 192) or even homoerotic bonding ("Huck Honey") in American literature. The relationship between the 'Great Snake' Chingachgook and Hawkeye, the Good Companions, in James Fenimore Cooper's *The Last of the Mohicans* (1826) is interracial and homosocial. By the 1870s, however, the reincarnations of Hawkeye and Chingachgook would be Cowboy and Indian. Now the only good Indian was a dead Indian (Mieder). This contrast suggests two extremes of homosocial interethnic relations, harmonious and adversarial.

Stories about Qing dynasty history tend to reflect the ethnic tensions of the period. Stories by the Hakka writer Long Yingzong give a gritty portrayal of antagonistic relations between the hill-dwelling Hakka and the highland aborigines in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. "Night Flood" 夜流 is about Hakka camphor loggers and kiln operators scalped by Atayal braves, while "The Huang Family" 黃家 is about the owner of a trading post who cheats his Atayal customers.

[3] Benedict Anderson has described Taiwanese nationalism as settler nationalism ("Western Nationalism and Eastern Nationalism"). It is problematic to describe Chinese nationalism, as I am doing, as a kind of settler nationalism, because the KMT was not trying to distinguish Taiwanese culture from metropolitan culture, as Australian settler nationalists did Australian culture from British. I describe Chinese nationalism on Taiwan as assimilationist settler nationalism because in cultural production relating to the aborigines Chinese nationalists justified the nationalist presence on and control of the island.

In Li Qiao's Wintry Night 寒夜三部曲,[4] the most important Hakka settler epic, concessions are made to early historic antagonisms, but later unity achieved in the presence of a common enemy, the Japanese (Balcom 15). The Peng family pioneer in Fanzai ('savage') Wood. They initially suffer headhunting attacks. A Chinese nicknamed Three Chops 三刀 leads the pioneers against the aborigines. One might expect the aborigines to be denigrated, but there is no necessary connection between conflict with and denigration of an indigenous enemy. *La Araucana*, the national epic of Chile, tells the story of the defeat of the noble Araucanian indigenes. It was by Alonso de Ercilla (1533-1595), who participated in but was critical of the conquest. *Wintry Night* is a recounting of the story of settlement a century after the fact by a humanitarian Hakka intellectual who, from internal evidence in *Wintry Night* at least, was more inclined to ennoble or even identify with the aborigines. The foremost aboriginal chief in *Wintry Night*, Beidu Babo 北都·巴博, is a champion deer hunter, "a leader of outstanding mental and physical abilities," and a hunter of twelve human heads (Li Qiao 37). Unlike in *La Araucana*, the aborigines end up teaming up with the Hakka rebels or 'bandits' against the Japanese at the Battle of Malabang. In his short story "Battle of Malabang" 馬拉邦戰記. Li Qiao went back to the material of the initial resistance to the Japanese three years after publishing *Wintry Night*. At a time when the aborigines had an increased prominence in the public sphere, Li Qiao gave Beidu Babo a much more prominent role in the story, so that it can no longer be said that, as in *Wintry Night*, the aborigines "are lacking in any consciousness" (Balcom 15).

The strongly anti-Japanese character of *Wintry Night* allies the work with state propaganda films in the 1970s. The most distinctive feature of *Wintry Night* is therefore not resistance to the Japanese but spiritual communion, almost but not quite in the manner of Hawkeye and Chingachgook in *The Last of the Mohicans*, where the two companions are a white man and a Mohican. In many homosocial settler narratives, the settler hero 'goes native' to some degree; but there is usually resistance to the loss of identity. Hawkeye remains an American frontiersman, a man without a 'cross,' a man without any native blood. One of the characters in *Wintry Night* may be biracial: many stories circulate about Three Chops: that the aborigines killed his wife, but also that he is a half-breed or full-blood aborigine. He at least knows some "Taiya" (38). A decade after the publication of *Wintry Night*, Taiwanese intellectuals would be insisting on their plains aborigine blood, as the racial prong of the Taiwanese nation-building project (see Brown, *Is Taiwan Chinese?*). Other characters, like Hawkeye, merely put on the trappings of native identity. This is what happens in *Wintry Night*. When Ahan and Qiu Mei, the locally born Hakka and the Hakka from Henan, return from the Battle of Malabang, "both men were dressed in native garb and carried long-handled native knives" (148). They even reveal that they have "cut off Jap heads" (149), appropriating what was originally a proof of aboriginal manhood as a symbol of national resistance.

The nation-building function of unity against the Japanese is clear, but spiritual communion is also reminiscent of an observation about settler discourse, that in their narratives settlers represent the acquisition of the backwoods abilities of the Indians in order to assert indigeneity, to nativize themselves (Lawson and Johnson 363). In my opinion, this was not the whole purpose of Li Qiao and other settler epic writers such as Zhong Zhaozheng, especially in *Song of Mount Tianshan* 插天山之歌 (1975; film 2006). While they were indeed insisting on a place in Taiwanese history for the Hakka settlers, and perhaps even, in an instance of settler nationalism, building an alternative national identity, they were also genuinely interested in the aborigines. The spiritual nature of the indigenous identification in the Hakka settler epics redeems them and distinguishes them from settler epics generally, which are now hard to read

[4] In the translation by Balcom and Liu, the trilogy is condensed into a single volume.

because of the sense of settler superiority in them, as in Knut Hamsun's Nobel Prize winning *Growth of the Soil* (Jernsletten 73), or of their neat erasure of the aborigines, as in the works of Laura Ingalls Wilder.

"The story of Mount Taimu" 泰姆山記 also by Li Qiao, is also a story of communion, but it differs in one crucial respect from *Wintry Night*. "Taimu" describes the last days of the Hakka author Lu Heruo. Lu lived most of his life under the Japanese, but died six years after the Retrocession, in 1951. As Angelina Yee notes, the note of spiritual solidarity between Hakka and aborigines is pronounced:

Describing the solidarity between the fugitive and the aborigines, who lead him through dangerous mountain paths to escape KMT capture, Li eulogizes the simplicity and grace of aboriginal worship of nature in contrast to the crassness and cruelty of mainland captors in hot pursuit. (97).

In this story, published five years after *Wintry Night* in 1984, Li Qiao switched the identity of the opposition to the Hakka-aborigine alliance from Japanese to mainlander Chinese. This is a clear instance of what Benedict Anderson would call settler nationalism, and what Anthony Moran would call indigenizing settler nationalism.

But must Taiwanese national identity, in whatever formulation, depend on an antagonist? As national narratives, *Wintry Night* and "Mount Taimu" teeter on the edge of crude melodrama. To rescue them from that brink, I would stress the signs in *Wintry Night* that the qualification for nationhood is neither a birthright nor indigeneity nor hatred of the Japanese or Chinese, but rather common decency. Consider the representation of the exploitation the villagers of Fanzai Wood suffer at the hands of the Taiwanese landowner Ye Atian. In the following scene, the settlers are being asked to sign new tenure agreements and warned that if they try to move away they will probably be scalped:

The natives give warnings before they attack, unlike you murderers," replied Rixing, gritting his teeth. "What protection has the imperial government given us? We ourselves are half-savage. We get along with the natives and offer them food, salt, and rice wine each year—not even of tenth of the pound of flesh you demand! (113).

The exploitation was exploitation regardless of Ye Atian's ethnic affiliation. Membership in the Taiwanese nation should be generosity, one hopes Li Qiao is saying. And lest one think that Li Qiao was anti-Chinese, as he has sometimes seemed to be in his writings in the 1980s and 1990s, one should remember that, in *Wintry Night*, Qiu Mei's knowledge of the classics (141) seems to be part of the Taiwanese cultural inheritance as well.

Long Yingzong and Li Qiao are Hakka writers, but the Chinese nationalist perspective has been reflected in homosocial narratives as well. In certain stories and films in the postwar period, there is conflict between aboriginal males and Chinese male heroes who bear the civilizing mission into savageland. The conflict is over control of local resources, including young women. The Chinese males fight with the aboriginal males for aboriginal women. In *On Mount Hehuan* 合歡山上, made in 1958 by the Ministry of National Defense to celebrate the building of the Central Cross Island Highway, aboriginal masculinity is either co-opted – one young aborigine named Afu is given a job by the hero of the film, Liang Jinhao, on the roadbuilding crew, which means that he has to exchange aboriginal attire for Chinese work clothes – or simply overcome, as when Liang Jinhao discovers another aboriginal man, who has been peeping at his womenfolk, suffering from snakebite in a forest grove. Luckily Liang Jinhao has an antidote pill, displaying the superiority of the modern medicine over shamanic healing. In the climax of

the film, Afu accidentally blows Liang Jinhao up when he trips over the detonator. Luckily Liang Jinhao survives. In general, the aboriginal male in such works is a bumbling fool, a figure of fun.

Finally, there is also the story of Wu Sha, told in the last movie of the great director Li Xing, *The Heroic Pioneers* 唐山過台灣 (1986). Wu Sha was the 'heroic' leader of the effort to settle the Yilan (Ilan) Plain, and in this film the Han Chinese become the benefactors of the aborigines. In the work, there is a clear distinction between the Kavalan aborigines, who are gentle, and the Atayal aborigines, who are savage headhunters. The settlers are attacked by the Atayal, but manage to survive. The Kavalan chief is an old partner of Wu Sha's, but he is being somewhat uncooperative regarding the land issue.[5] Wu Sha changes the chief's mind when the tribe is plagued with smallpox. The condition was described as *tianhua* 天花 by Inō Kanori, but as Wu Sha saves the sick with Traditional Chinese Medicine the problem was likely self-resolving. Lian Heng described the problem as 'carbuncles' 痘 (655). At any rate, out of gratitude the Kavalan chief accepts Wu Sha's terms of land use, which are far more generous than the aborigines were ever given historically, as well as Wu Sha's offer to teach the aborigines how to plant the land properly. In doing so, Wu Sha was ignoring Kavalan land use practices, which included planting millet on slopeland and hunting on the plains. Hearing this offer, the chief tells Wu Sha: "You are my true friend!" The story of Wu Sha, which was as recently as 2001 still in a primary school textbook,[6] stresses brotherhood between aborigines and Chinese. But in this brotherhood there is an implicit hierarchical relation. The hierarchical nature of this relation becomes explicit in the tutelary narratives, the most famous of which I discuss in the next section.

2. Tutelary Narration

Settlers tend to justify their presence in a new land. One justification, expressed in religious or sometimes simply humanitarian terms, is the mission of civilization: the settlers are there to help the aborigines. There were other justifications, including prestige, security, population pressure, and economic advantage (Confer). These justifications have been promoted in cultural production. In the Academy Award winning *Cimarron*, released in 1931, the Oklahoma land rushes in 1889 and 1894 are justified by the claim that the settlers were bringing civilization to the Cherokee diaspora. In the Wu Sha story, the moral justification—the aborigines need Chinese assistance—was the most important. In Lian Heng's account, there was also a strategic concern—Taiwan's fate lay in the balance of the conquest of Yilan (658)—as well as population pressure, for in the wake of the Lin Shuangwen rebellion the west coast was in chaos. But when the ethics of settlement is challenged, the tutelary justification will seem most convincing. In the history of French colonialism, ethical justifications were not dominant until the 19th century (Confer 359), and as we shall see they were not important in early versions of the story of Wu Feng.

The most important tutelary story in the postwar period is *Wu Feng: The Christ of the East*,[7] in which the interpreter Wu Feng tries for decades in the eighteenth century to convince the aborigines to renounce human sacrifice, eventually donning a red cloak, mounting a white horse, and riding off to his destiny: he allows the aborigines to kill him so that they will finally abandon the practice of human sacrifice. No aborigine was still headhunting in 1962. In 1949, when *Storm Over Alishan* 阿里山風雲, the

---

[5] In other parts of Taiwan, there were aboriginal landlords, as there was some protection for aboriginal land rights. But not in Yilan at the time. Wu Sha and the settlers were squatters. This film is dishonest about the social history of the area.

[6] In the *Guoyu* 國語 textbook (grade 5 term 2) published by Senseio (30-31).

[7] This subtitle appears in the movie but was not in the original Chinese. I assume it was added to make the film more appealing to a foreign audience.

first postwar film to tell the Wu Feng story, was made, there were still communists and renegade aborigines at large in the mountains (see Harrison, "Changing Nationalities, Changing Ethnicities" for examples). In 1949, the import of the Wu Feng story might have been the security situation in the mountains. In 1962, the meaning of human sacrifice in this film was aboriginal backwardness, and Wu Feng stands for the beneficent state helping the aborigines to civilize. The film is obviously tendentious, but I think it has been contradictorily criticized. It was preposterous to name Wu Feng Township the district that on March 1, 1989 was redesignated Xinyi Township, and it was wrong to put the Wu Feng story in the elementary textbooks, in which headhunting is described as a bad or evil custom and in which the aborigines deify Wu Feng (in Li Yiyuan 10). But the aborigines are shown in the film to respect contractual relations: they abide by the agreement they make with Wu Feng to use the heads they took in the Zhu Yigui rebellion in 1721 one a year in their annual sacrificial ritual, which is a regulated rite and a social institution, not bloodlust. Respect for contracts is surely virtuous from the postwar Chinese perspective. Aborigines had already entered into contractual relations in the eighteenth century, and typically it was the Chinese settlers who disrespected them. In this regard, the 1949 and 1962 Wu Feng films represent the Chinese settler incursions on aboriginal territory very negatively, in contrast to *The Heroic Pioneers* or even *Wintry Night*. Taiwanese settlers are being criticized along with the aborigines. Only Wu Feng the interpreter comes out untarnished morally, which is dubious from the perspective of historical accuracy as well as contemporary relevance—if Wu Feng is symbolically the KMT he appears rather too benevolent. At the beginning of the film he is a trader, reflecting perhaps the KMT's attraction to alpine resource extraction, but after he becomes interpreter he embraces a moral mission in a totally disinterested fashion.

By contrast, earlier versions of the story were much harsher on the aborigines. The first Wu Feng-related cultural product was a poem from 1855 by Liu Jiamou, in which the proclivities of the typical interpreter are described as marrying raw savage women and inciting attacks on settlers. In Liu's account, Wu Feng is not only righteous but also martial. After his death he appears brandishing a sword and riding a horse. The aborigines associate the apparition with the epidemic from which they suffer and do obeisance to him (in Li Yiyuan 2). In a note on Wu Feng in a compendium, the bone-bred bloodlust of the aborigines is emphasized, and a rational explanation for the 'apparition' is provided: Wu Feng tells his family to burn effigies of him after he is gone. The aborigines see the effigies and assume Wu Feng lives on in ghostly form (in Li Yiyuan 3-4). In 1912, a Japanese colonial official, Nakada Naohisa 中田直久, added a Confucian dimension: now Wu Feng "sacrificed himself to fulfill humankindness."[8] In the same year, the former civil governor-general Gotō Shinpei 後藤新平, at a time when governor-general Sakuma Samata 佐久間左馬太 was crushing resistance among the Atayal, wrote an inscription for a stele erected at Alishan to commemorate Wu Feng. His accompanying address is not Confucian but sadistic. Wu Feng's family prays for the annihilation of the aborigines: "...let calamity strike the savage villages, that none remain" (in Li Yiyuan 5). After the tribe is struck by the epidemic, the aboriginal shaman says that if they worship Wu Feng they can avert death. Finally, Gotō, who was around this time serving a term as Minister of Communications 遞信大臣, links Wu Feng's taming of the aborigines to plans for national development, to the building of railway and power lines to Alishan (5). Lian Heng's *History of Taiwan* 台灣通史 rereads Wu Feng according to the racialist discourse prevalent in Republican China at the time. Wu Feng now dies for "the Han race" (Lian Heng 622), whereas by 1962 the Chinese intelligentsia, embracing a northern origin theory of aboriginal extraction (Stainton, "Politics" 37), had decided that the aborigines

[8] For the use of the story in the Japanese era, see Ching, *Becoming* 153-160 and Kleeman 26-27.

and Han were of the same race. In contrast to the 1962 film, in which Wu Feng is paternal, he is genocidal in Lian Heng's account. He intends to "die and become a vindictive spirit, certain to annihilate the aborigines" (Lian Heng 622). The savages are ferocious and bloodthirsty by nature, according to Lian Heng. Wu Feng resolves to deal with them manfully and martially. Now he has a gang of supporters, wood cutters and rattan pickers, whom he tells to lie in wait and start shooting when they see the aborigines. He fights the savage king in the hall of his compound and, upon dying, shouts, "Wu Feng is going to kill the Savages!" (Lian Heng 622). His family handles the special effects: the few aborigines that make it past the ambush see Wu Feng 'ghost' chasing them from behind. Out of fear, aboriginal women stay at home; they have nothing to eat; and they suffer an epidemic, which only abates when they worship Wu Feng as a god (Lian Heng 623), just as the natives worshipped Wu Sha according to Lian Heng (656). The two stories are cut from the same cloth. In the 1962 film, the aborigines commit suicide out of regret by jumping off a cliff—by far the most regrettable aspect of the film—while Lian Heng's version seems more like a shootout in a Western film. We know that by the late 1920s American Westerns or Japanese films were based on them were shown in Taiwan (Watan; Li Daoming). Lian Heng had probably never seen a Western. He interprets Wu Sha and Wu Feng as traditional Chinese righteous knights 武俠. At any rate, Lian Heng's racist triumphalism contrasts with the 1962 film's moralizing and satisfaction of the desire of urban audiences for things aboriginal.

Wu Sha is still represented positively today, but Wu Feng's days were numbered. In a serious misreading of the field of cultural production, the poet Yang Mu 楊牧 wrote an 'epic drama' about Wu Feng in 1978. In 1980, the scholar Chen Qinan 陳其南 published an article in the newspaper exposing the whole tradition as a fabrication. Anthropologist Hu Taili 胡台麗 published "Death of Wu Feng" 吳鳳之死, a short story that collapsed the skeleton of fact upon which the red cloak of myth had been draped and focused on current not historical or mythic conditions. It was only a matter of time before Wu Feng statues would be pulled down, Wu Feng Rural Township redesignated, and the Wu Feng story taken out of the textbooks.

3. Romance Narration

The romance is a favorite mode of narration for state-sponsored cultural production, for it allowed for the creation of what Doris Sommer, in her book on the national romances of Latin America, has called 'foundational fictions,' in which conflicts between social blocs dissolve in the illusions of love.

The story of Pocahontas, the most famous foundational fiction of them all, and a settler romance at that, is endlessly fascinating in fact and fiction. Jamestown was the first permanent settlement on the eastern seaboard, and recent research has emphasized the unintentional environmental impact of the European colonists: that the potato and the tomato came from the Americas is common knowledge, but what scholars now call the Columbian Exchange involved give as well as take: the colonists introduced certain species of butterflies and earthworms, changing the ecology of North America permanently (Mann 1). In his own account, John Smith was rescued by the Algonquian princess Pocahontas from certain death at the hands of her father Powhatan. Scholars of 'colonial discourse' have suggested that in fact Smith was in no danger, that Powhatan was carrying out a ritual of adoption (Hulme 150). The colonial meaning of the event, at any rate, was clear: Pocahontas welcomed Smith to the New World and protected him from Indian masculinity (Tilton 4).

After Smith left, Pocahontas was kidnapped by the Jamestown settlers. She was eventually baptized Rebecca, and she married John Rolfe. She had a child with Rolfe, toured England and died on

the way back. The tragic death of the white man's native lover became a motif in innumerable stories throughout North America in the succeeding centuries (Oshana 48). In the early nineteenth century Pocahontas's story was rewritten according to the conventions of the eighteenth century novelistic genre of sentimental romance. Now she falls in love at first sight with John Smith; her teacup trembles when she meets him again as Rebecca Rolfe (qtd. in Hulme 137). Both her 'salvation' of Smith and her Christian conversion have become part of American national mythology, enshrined in two of the scenes in the Frieze of American History in the Rotunda in the United States Capitol. By the decade before the Civil War, cultural political struggles between south and north found a focus in Pocahontas. Northerners ridiculed her, while she became a symbol of distinction for southerners (Abrams). Certain Virginians liked to imagine they were descended from Algonquian royalty (Tilton 171), just as certain Taiwanese nationalists like to emphasize the fraction of plains aboriginal blood that flows through their veins as a sign of Taiwanese national difference.

Métissage is a feature of every settler society, and in settler societies tales of interracial love tend to acquire a colonial or national significance. They may not always. Early tales of intermarriage in Qing dynasty Taiwan are by no means romantic. In one folktale set in Tainan, for instance Chen Jia 陳佳 marries uxorilocally into a Plains Aborigine tribe. His wife is the chief's daughter. Later, when the chief is preparing to lead the tribe out of captivity in their own land, Chen Jia asks for a dowry 嫁妝: all the land he can plow in a single day. The chief, drunk with millet wine, agrees. Instead of plowing in the normal way, Chen Jia traces the circumference of a circle. The chief, having agreed to the settler's rules of the game, has no choice but to give him all the land within. The story exists in several variant forms (Hu 130-137; Jin 27; Wang 1229-1230),[9] but in each case the theme of trickery is clear. The stories are presented as pure narrative, without moral commentary or reports of interior mental states, as if they circulated in oral form as crystallizations of *savoir-faire* for land-hungry settlers. There is no ideological content to such stories.

Emma Teng, in *Taiwan's Imagined Geography*, a landmark monograph on the representation of the Formosan aborigines and landscapes during the Qing period, discusses a tale with obvious ideological content, the story of the Lady Baozhu (Teng 188-189). Specifically, Teng looks at how a local official crosses two stories, one about a female chieftain and the other about a Chinese courtesan who marries a savage chief, and gets a hybrid story about a female chieftain who happens to be Chinese. In this role, she begins the process of assimilation. The story is interesting because the gender hierarchy is reversed when ethnicity is added to the equation, and in this regard it recalls the tradition of Chinese princesses like Wang Zhaojun civilizing frontier barbarian kings (see Bulag, "Naturalizing National Unity"), as does the story "Passionflower," to be discussed in a moment.

The representation of interethnic romance in the Japanese era has received a surprising amount of attention in English language scholarship (Ching, "Savage" and *Becoming* 161-168; Tierney 36-134; Kleeman 17-41; Kono "Writing"), though there is a lot of overlap. The representation of romance responded to historical developments. The Japanese public was first introduced to Taiwan's high mountain region in the late nineteenth century. Adventurers such as Kondō the Barbarian, Kondō Katsusaburō, who married a headman's daughter named Iwan Robau, were reported on in the media (Barclay 341). There was a "florid description" of another couple's "mutual attraction and emotional entanglement in a Tokyo newspaper" (Barclay 343). While the colonial authorities initially encouraged

[9] Thanks to Miss Mei-hui Cheng 鄭美惠 for the citations. See Works Cited for her dissertation on interethnic relations in Formosan folklore.

intermarriage as an initial strategy of governance, by the 1920s there were concerns about the offense to local mores. When Satō Haruo spoke of "dangerously erotic possibilities" (Kono 143 note 62) in his travel memoir "Musha" [Wushe, 1920], he was prescient. A decade later, Japanese maltreatment of local women became one of the instigating factors of the Wushe Incident in 1930 (Barclay; Ching, *Becoming Japanese* 141-142). Lai He's 1931 poem "Southern Elegy" 南國悲歌 also makes this connection. In the decade after the Incident, there were stories about the terrible consequences of romance between Japanese and aborigine, in which men go native or worse. In Oshika Taku's "The Savage," the alpine romance has gone gothic: this is a bloody story with a scene of decapitation about a Japanese policeman going native. In the 1940s, the romance is toned down. In "Passionflower" (Sakaguchi Reiko 坂口零子's "Tokeisō" 時計草) the identity of the dominant party in the romance is switched from Japanese man to Japanese woman, and the imperial civilizing mission not mutual attraction draws the couple together (Kono). In the film *Bell of Sayon* 沙鴦之鐘, a young aboriginal woman yearns for the Japanese administrator of her village, while her aboriginal admirers yearn for her: the film encourages aboriginal braves to prove their love by going to fight for the emperor in the South Seas. In the end, Sayon sacrifices herself for the imperial war effort, drowning in a river while carrying luggage for the departing administrator (Ching, "Savage Construction" 810-815; Kleeman 34-36).

In the postwar period, there were several works in which the aboriginal maiden becomes Chinese.10 One of the most interesting is On Mount Hehuan 合歡山上, which I have touched on above in connection with the humiliation of the aboriginal male in homosocial narratives. The film celebrates the transformation of the mountains into roads and farmland, and of the aborigines into Chinese citizens. The hero of the film, Liang Jinhao, is a Chinese explosives engineer. On his day off he goes hunting in the forest and discovers a village in a valley. He goes into the village and discovers that the aborigines are church goers. There's a church in everyone's heart, the pastor says to Liang Jinhao.11 While listening to the service, he falls in love with a beautiful woman named Ailan. She is bodacious, but she dresses and talks like a Chinese. She is also a teacher, who has returned to the village to serve her community rather than stay down on the plains.12 Now Chinese herself, she will now reproduce Chinese cultural norms in the hearts and minds of her students. However, there is a bad place in the village, a bar where the Banana Boat Song plays on the radio. A contemporary pop song, it is a nice suggestion of cultural globalization. It is ear candy, but also a social evil. Outside the village is the countryside. It is a pristine setting for singing duets between Liang Jinhao and Ailan, but Liang Jinhao tells Ailan that any open space should be developed. At the end of the film, they have developed that open space, and are just getting ready to farm

---

10 Which creates problems for a scholar who wishes to use the notion of 'suborientalism' or 'internal orientalism' to study the cultural production of settler societies. Roughly, internal orientalism would mean that the Chinese settlers of Taiwan have represented the aborigines as being other, in order both to dominate them and to establish their own identity as modern and rational in contrast to the aborigines. There is something to the argument, and Chiu Yen-liang has applied it to Taiwan ("Suborientalism"). It may be part of cultural commodification, of images of aborigines in colorful dress dancing around a fire for the pleasure of Chinese viewers. However, it does not account for the cultural production of either assimilatory or indigenizing settler nationalism in postwar Taiwan.

11 The burden of civilization the state bore was lightened by Christian missionaries. President and Madame Jiang were both Methodists, as was Jiang Jingguo, but it is not clear to what extent they shared the missionary impulse. Opening the mountains to missionaries pleased the United States. The missionary presence was also conducive to social control. This is not to disrespect the importance that Christianity has had in many aborigines' lives since it was introduced in the 1860s, or the importance that the Presbyterian Church has had in the aboriginal movement (Stainton, "Presbyterians").

12 The state was worried about the outflux of aboriginal women to the plains into prostitution and marriage with mainlander soldiers. There were restrictions on marriage (Harrison 77), but they were ineffective, and liberals like He Fan, Lin Haiyin's husband, said that such restrictions were illiberal and that aboriginal women should be able to do as they pleased ("Mountain Maidens Love the Plain" 山姑愛平地).

it. High mountain farming became a trope in many works of this period for the preservation of traditional Chinese culture.13

From the mid-1950s to the late 1960s was the great age of interethnic romance in Taiwanese film and fiction. An editorial from 1969 ("Getting Worse All the Time") complains about the number of lowbrow interethnic love stories on television. In 1970, interethnic romance suddenly dropped out of local cultural production. In a decade of diplomatic crisis, many defined national identity in opposition to Japan and the United States. In an age of industrial deepening, camphor and apples and all the fruits of the mountains seemed less attractive than before. Nativist writers invested their sentiments in the egalitarian plain,[14] which is somewhat ironic because the plain had become egalitarian because of the KMT's land reform in the early 1950s. At any rate, while Hakka writers like Li Qiao and Zhong Zhaozheng maintained an interest in the aborigines in general in the 1970s, the winsome aboriginal maiden would not reappear in Chinese film and fiction until the 1980s. No longer a symbol of the success of the national project of modernization, she was now a sign of its inequalities. As Daria Berg has pointed out in her article on Wu Jinfa, many of the stories and films about the Formosan aborigines from the 1980s were about prostitution; but I think the most interesting stories are about marriage 'transactions,' in which retired mainlander soldiers purchased nubile aboriginal brides. The first story about this phenomenon was "Sea and Land" 海與大地 by Song Zelai in 1977, but the most famous treatment was *The Second Spring of Old Mo* 老莫的第二個春天, which won a Golden Horse award in 1984.

Old Mo is a trash man in his 50s. His friend from the army has purchased an aboriginal bride named Mana, a very aboriginal name, and Old Mo wants a son. He decides to follow suit and buys a Bunun maiden named Yuzhen 玉珍, a very Chinese name, for a hundred thousand dollars, only several thousand dollars American, from her parents in a mountain village. The whole process, from the oily middleman and the mother coldly counting the cash to the tacky wedding ceremony, is realistically presented. But thereafter the film becomes overtly didactic. Yuzhen is chaste: she rejects the advances of her business partner, a handsome young fellow with a motorcycle who speaks a bit of Bunun. She is industrious: she starts an aboriginal delicacies stand and is very successful. She is strong: she socks the bad guys in the smoky movie theatre. So in the marriage she is the protector and the provider. But this is not a women's or aboriginal liberation movie. It is socially conservative, hence the scenes in which Yuzhen salutes dominant males leaving by train, first her husband's former commander and later Old Mo himself.[15] The movie is also nationalist in the sense that Yuzhen is Sinified: she speaks Taiwanese and listens to brainless Mandopop, she dresses like a Chinese after she gets married, and she cooks Chinese food for her husband, though she turns aboriginal treats into commodities. By contrast, Mo's friend's wife Mana 瑪娜 consorts with hoodlums instead of staying put at home or in the market, gets pregnant, infects her husband with syphilis, becomes a drug addict, and jumps to her death from a bridge with a baby in her belly. In other words, the film is teaching us that the secret of success for aboriginal women purchased as brides for much older Chinese men is to uphold bourgeois virtue, practice petty capitalism, and assimilate into Chinese society. At the end, Yuzhen is pregnant, and Mr. Mo is planning for everyone to visit Shandong, China.

---

[13] This attempt to modernize without loss of tradition has been studied by such scholars as Prasenjit Duara (*Sovereignty and Authenticity*) and Partha Chatterjee (*The Nation and Its Fragments*). For the KMT's Leninist attempt to do this by penetrating every crevice of society, see Allen Chun's "From Nationalism to Nationalizing."

[14] Thanks to Mr. Stuart Thompson of the LSE for this insight.

[15] For stills from *Old Mo* and *On Mount Hebuan*, please see: http://www.tiprc.org.tw/ePaper/05/05_alan.html.

A final example of a romance story freighted with nationalism, this time indigenising Taiwanese settler nationalism, is the series called *Last of the Siraya* 西拉雅族的末裔 by the writer Ye Shitao 葉石濤. Usually such stories, about the last of the Mohicans, the Beothuk, or the Yahi, are sad or elegiac. They were a part of the tradition of tales about the vanishing American. But Ye Shitao's stories are triumphant tales of natiogenesis. Silverflower Pan, the heroine of the series, is the last of the Siraya but she is at the same time the daughter of the earth and the mother of the Taiwanese nation. She has five lovers, all of whom are Chinese, three Taiwanese, one from the gentry, one petty landowner, and one nationalist dissident, and two mainlanders, both retired soldiers. The multiethnic community Silverflower has created by the end of the fifth story[16] is clearly allegorical, and while all racial or class backgrounds are accepted in the community, the series does plug into the racialist strain of Taiwanese nationalist discourse, because Silverflower's two children are biracial. In terms of economic philosophy, the Silverflower series is in tune with *The Second Spring With Old Mo*, as both seem to advocate something like petty capitalism.[17] Though she creates relations of fictive kinship with a widow of a nationalist dissident and her sister, whom she asks to manage her sundry goods store, Silverflower owns all the private property in a community of something like twenty people.

Conclusion

In this essay I have focused on the presence of two kinds of settler nationalism, assimilationist and indigenising, in three modes of narration about the Formosan aborigines. I found that Chinese nationalists shied away from homosocial narration for the most part, Taiwanese nationalists from tutelary narration – because they liked to imagine Taiwanese nationalism was something like a process of nature, in need of no education – while both made use of romance narration. In conclusion, I would like to sketch out how Chinese writers and filmmakers not only appropriated the Formosan aborigine for nationalism, but also criticized the state treatment of the aborigines and also of the island of Taiwan.

We can see this kind of reconsideration in later retellings of the story of Pocahontas. In 1930, the poet Hart Crane published "The Bridge." Pocahontas—The Mother of Us All, "the physical body of the continent or the soil" as Crane described her in a letter (qtd. in Fiedler, *Return* 64)—reappears in reincarnation as a stripper in a seedy nightclub. Pocahontas was also a symbol of Indian abjection in Karl Barth's novel *The Sot-Weed Factor*, published at the beginning of the Civil Rights era in 1960, in which John Smith's self-glorifying account of his relationship with Pocahontas is parodied.

The reconsideration of the fate of the Formosan aborigine began early in the postwar period. Wang Zhenhe's "Summer Day" 夏日, published in July 1961 in the journal *Modern Literature* 現代文學, was the first such work. In it, an abandoned aboriginal wife wanders around friendless in a worker's village at a Taipower power plant. Her husband Qiangming is off whoring and gambling, while her mother-in-law has the gall to tell her, "It's not like you didn't know you're just no match for our

[16] The stories are in narrative order Last of the Siraya 西拉雅族的末裔, Wild Chrysanthemum 野菊花, Parting at Dawn 黎明的訣別, Silverflower Pan's Fifth Man 潛銀花的第五個男人, and Pan Yinhua and Her Sworn Sisters 潛銀花的換帖姐妹們.

[17] In Hill Gates's account ("Ethnicity and Social Class"), petty capitalism is a mode of production in which the means of production are owned by families, which may buy or sell labor from other families depending on need. Petty capitalists resist the extractions of both the tributary and capitalist modes of production. In Ye Shitao's series particularly, Silverflower wants to have nothing to do with the state.

Qiangming!" The exploitation of aboriginal women by capitalism with state collusion is also a subtext of Wang Zhenhe's well-known novel *Rose, Rose, I Love You*, published in 1984.

The writer Zhu Xining's novella "Snake House" 蛇屋 from 1963 is about a soldier assigned to teach Chinese in an aboriginal community who is surprised by lust for one of his teenaged students. While endorsing the state project of civilization and development in the same way as *On Mount Hehuan* – the hero has built a giant flood embankment before arriving in the mountains – Zhu's novella draws a comparison between Japanese abuse of aboriginal women and Chinese abuse of aboriginal women after the war, because the Chinese police officer in the community has impregnated another of the young teenage girls. Luckily, the hero manages to overcome lust and send his student down to the plains to become a nurse. However, the criticism of state representatives in the novella is acute.

The most important recent critical novel is Wu He's *Remains of Life* 餘生, written about Wu He's stay in Qingliu Village, where the survivors of the Wushe Incident were forced to move by the Japanese after the dust had settled. Wu He, like Zhu Xining, links Japanese rule and KMT rule, for both were assimilatory. Wu He, of course, was writing in the 1990s, when the value of aboriginal cultures had finally been affirmed but when the aborigines had already lost a lot of their culture and their self-respect. Wu He's most important and interesting companion is Maiden 姑娘, a thirty-something former prostitute and deadbeat mother who is whiling away her time on the reservation. Rather than the beneficiary of the benevolence of an assimilatory state, as in so many of the nationalist narratives I have been discussing, Maiden is partly a victim of the desire of Chinese society for aboriginality, including aboriginal women. A pimp of hers once told her not to shave her armpits, because customers like women of 'alien races.' This very rich novel is about a lot of things, but very generally it is about the objectification and commodification of aboriginal people and culture, a sad comment on the ethical basis of the ever beautiful 'island nation' 島國.

Recent films have also critiqued the settler state and society on Taiwan using homosocial narration. In *Two Sign Painters* 兩個油漆匠 (1990), a filmic adaptation of Huang Chunming's short story of the same name, a mainlander and an aborigine, work side by side as skyscraper sign-painters in Taipei, both displaced and exploited by their Taiwanese employer. It seems the Hakka were not the only ones who communed with the aborigines. In the original short story, both painters were from the country, their employer a city crook. The theme of ethnic exploitation is much more prominent in the film, which seems as if it might be a mainlander response to Taiwanese claims about the unequal distribution of capital favoring mainlanders in postwar Taiwan. At the same time, the film speaks more for the aborigine than for the mainlander. Though both are displaced and diasporic, the aborigine is more abject, oppressed both in the city and at home: he comes from a village near the land leased to Asia Cement (see Simon), and the destructiveness of limestone mining to the beautiful alpine environment around Hualian is exposed in the film. In the climax, the aborigine falls from top of the building to his death, his last memory of a Chinese girl with whom he fell in love but who was out of his league; the mainlander, by contrast, is taken home by his Taiwanese wife and son.

There are several other films from the late 1980s and 1990s in which violence is the aboriginal male response to exploitation, for instance *Barefoot Angel* 赤腳的天使, *Rite of Winter* 冬之際, and *Super Citizen* 超級公民. All have the 1986 Tang Yingshen case 湯英伸案 in mind, in which Tang Yingshen, a Tsou aborigine, murdered his exploitative Taiwanese employer. *Super Citizen* is the most forgiving of the violence, while in *Barefoot Angel* and *Rite of Winter* the necessity of 'taking responsibility' is emphasized at the same time as urban labor and alpine resource exploitation is exposed. In *Rite of Winter*, the Chinese policeman tells the aboriginal arsonist that a real man takes responsibility for his actions; but the aborigine

had only committed the crime because Chinese loggers working for a company that enjoyed a government contract and local collusion were cutting down the forest and enjoying the services of local women, who had become prostitutes in the presence of the foreign population. While not quite as radical as *Remains of Life*, all are understanding of the aboriginal plight and critical of the state and society of the settlers.

A final example of homosocial narration is Wu He's other aboriginal novel from the 1990s, entitled *Contemplating Abang and Auvini Kadresengan* 思索阿邦卡露斯, in which Wu He hangs out in a Rukai village with his friends, who include a Taiwanese photographer named Abang and the Rukai writer Auvini Kadresengan. The latter sees Wu He as a mentor, as is evident from his effusive "Afterword," but this is not a role Wu He would embrace. From a position of equality, Wu He contemplates Auvini Kadresengan contemplating himself, his cultural heritage, and his future. It is a promising example of how relations between Chinese and aborigines might be 're-emplotted.'

Finally, not surprisingly there are no recent instances of the tutelary mode of narration in Chinese works about the Formosan aborigine. While the respect of Chinese people for aboriginal cultures may not be very profound, respect is at least often expressed. If anything, the ethnic identity of the teacher and student is likely to be reversed in cultural production, the easy-going aborigine becoming the mentor, as in the films *Waiting for the Flying Fish* 等待飛魚, in which a Tawu youth of Orchid Island teaches a harried girl from Taipei to relax, and *The Sage Hunter* 山豬、飛鼠、撒可努, in which an aboriginal forest cop invites an official from the Ministry of Transport to visit him in Taidong in order to avert a highway development. Both films are from 2005, and both were made with a commercial intent, so that a fair bit of simplification and idealization of the situation of contemporary aborigines has gone on. Furthermore, the former might be classified as a romantic narrative, the former as a homosocial narrative, as there is no institutionally marked relation of tutelage. Nor have I found a Chinese work in which there is such a relation. One hopes it is only a matter of time.

Works Cited

Abrams, Ann Uhry. The Pilgrims and Pocahontas: Rival Myths of American Origin. Boulder: Westview Press, 1999.

Anderson, Benedict. "Western Nationalism and Eastern Nationalism: Is there a difference that matters?" New Left Review 9 (May-June 2001). 13 May 2008 <http://www.newleftreview.org/?view=2320>.

Balcom, John. "Translator's Introduction." Wintry Night. By Li Qiao. 1-17.

Barclay, Paul D. "Cultural Brokerage and Interethnic Marriage in Colonial Taiwan: Japanese Subalterns and Their Aborigine Wives, 1895-1930." Journal of Asian Studies 64.2 (May 2005): 323-360.

Barefoot Angel 赤腳天使 (film). Anji 安記, 1987.

Bell of Sayon サヨンの鐘 (film). 1943.

Berg, Daria. "Wu Jinfa and the Melancholy Mountain Forests of China's Border Cultures: New Voices in Taiwanese Literature." In In Search of the Hunters and their Tribes: Studies in the History and Culture of the Taiwan Indigenous Peoples, ed. David Faure. Taipei: Shung Ye Museum of Formosan Aborigines, 2002. 202-240.

Chang, Yvonne. "Representing Taiwan: Shifting Geopolitical Frameworks." Writing Taiwan: A New Literary History. Durham: Duke University Press, 2007.

Chatterjee, Partha. The Nation and Its Fragments. Princeton University Press, 1993.

Chen Qinan 陳其南. "Myth of Wufeng" 吳鳳的神話. 《台北民生報》 28 Jul. 1980.

Cheng, Mei-hui 鄭美惠. "台灣原/漢族群衝突下的傳說研究." Diss. Tsing Hua (Taiwan), 2008.

Ching, Leo T. S. 2000. "Savage Construction and Civility Making: the Musha Incident and Aboriginal Representations in Colonial Taiwan." Positions 8.3 (Winter 2000): 795-818.

Ching, Leo T. S. Becoming Japanese: Colonial Taiwan and the Politics of Identity Formation. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001.

Chiu Yen Liang Fred. "Suborientalism and the Subimperialist Predicament: Aboriginal Discourse and the Poverty of State-Nation Imagery." positions: east asia cultures critique 8.1 (2000): 101-149.

Chun, Allen. "From Nationalism to Nationalizing: Cultural Imagination and State Formation in Postwar Taiwan." The Australian Journal of Chinese Affairs 31 (Jan. 1994): 49-69.

Cimarron (film). 1931.

Confer, Vincent. "French Colonial Ideas before 1789." French Historical Studies 3.3 (Spring 1964): 338-359.
Duara, Prasenjit. Sovereignty and Authenticity. Lanham, Md.: Rowman & Littlefield, 2003.

Fiedler, Leslie. "Come Back to the Raft Ag'in, Huck Honey!" Partisan Review 25 (Jun. 1948): 664-671.

Fiedler, Leslie. Love and Death in the American Novel. New York: Stein and Day, 1960.

Fiedler, Leslie. The Return of the Vanishing American. New York. Stein and Day, 1969.

"Getting Worse All the Time: Taiwan Television Company Dramas." 每況愈下的電視劇: 台灣電視公司的電視劇. 《經濟日報》 17 Jun. 1969: 9.

Gates, Hill. "Ethnicity and Social Class." The Anthropology of Taiwanese Society. Ed. Emily Martin Ahern and Hill Gates. Stanford University Press, 1981. 241-281.

Harrell, Stevan. "Introduction: Civilizing Projects and the Reaction to Them." In Cultural Encounters on China's Ethnic Frontiers, ed. Stevan Harrell. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1995. 3-36.

He Fan. "*Mountain Maidens Love the Plain*" 山姑愛平地. *Lianhebao* 9 May 1958: 6.

Hu Taili 胡台麗. "Death of Wu Feng" 吳鳳之死. In 《悲情的山林》, ed. Wu Jinfa. Taizhong: Chenxing, 1987. 73-92.

Hu Wanchuan, ed. 胡萬川總編. 《苗栗縣民間文學集(9)》. In《苗栗縣閔南語故事(2)》. 苗栗: 苗栗縣文化局, 2001.

Huang Chunming 黃春明. "Two Sign Painters" 兩個油漆匠. 《文學雙月刊》 1 (1971).

Hulme, Peter. Colonial Encounters: Europe and the Native Caribbean, 1492-1797. London: Methuen, 1986.

Hunt, Lynn. The Family Romance of the French Revolution. University of California Press, 1993.

Inō Kanori 伊能嘉矩. "On Marriages between Aborigines and Chinese in Taiwan" 台灣における民番の結婚に就きて. Taiwan kanshū kiji 3.11: 1016-20.

Jernsletten, Kikki. "The Sámi in growth of the soil: Depictions, desire, denial." Nordlit 15 (2004): 73-89. 13 May 2008 <http://uit.no/getfile.php?PageId=977&FileId=186>.

Jin Ronghua, ed. 金榮華整理. 《台桃竹苗地區民間故事集》. 新店: 中國口傳文學學會, 2000.

Kleeman, Faye Yuan. Under an Imperial Sun: Japanese Colonial Literature of Taiwan and the South. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 2003.

Kono, Kimberly. "Writing Colonial Lineage in Sakaguchi Reiko's "Tokeiso."" The Journal of Japanese Studies 32.1 (2006): 83-117.

Lai He 賴和. "Southern Elegy" 南國哀歌. 《台灣新民報》 361-362 (May 1931).

Lawson, Alan and Anna Johnston. "Settler Colonies." A Companion to Postcolonial Studies, ed. Henry Schwarz and Sangeeta Ray. Blackwell, 2000. 360-376.

Li Daoming 李道明. 由活動影像看鄒族. 《電影欣賞》 69 (1994). 13 May 2008 <http://techart.tnua.edu.tw/~dmlee/article7.html>.

Li Qiao 李喬. "Battle of Malabang" 馬拉邦戰記. 《台灣時報》. 1 Jan. 1982. (see <http://literature.ihakka.net/hakka/author/li_qiao/default_comlist.htm>)

Li Qiao 李喬. "The Story of Mount Taimu" 泰姆山記. 《台灣文藝》 86 (Jan. 1984).

Li Qiao 李喬. Wintry Night 寒夜. Trans. Taotao Liu and John Balcom. New York: Columbia University Press, 2001.

Li Yiyuan 李亦園. "傳說與課本—吳鳳傳說及其相關問題的人類學探討." 13 May 2008 <http://www.nict.gov.tw/tc/learning/003/PDF/600/N0030001P.pdf>.

Lian Heng 連橫. History of Taiwan 台灣通史. Taipei: Youshi 幼獅, 1977 [1920].

Liu Jiamou 劉家謀. "海音詩." 1855. In Li Yiyuan.

Long Yingzong 龍瑛宗. "Night Flood" 夜流. 《民眾日報》 3-5 Aug. 1979.

Long Yingzong 龍瑛宗. "The Huang Family" 黃家. 《文藝》, 8.11 (1 Nov. 1940). Trans. in 《植有木瓜樹的小鎮》. Taipei: Yuanjing, 1979.

Mann, Charles C. "America: Lost and Found." National Geographic (May 2007): 1-3. 13 May, 2007 <http://www.charlesmann.org/articles/NatGeo-Jamestown-05-07-1.htm>.

Mieder, Wolfgang. "'The Only Good Indian is a Dead Indian': History and Meaning of a Proverbial Stereotype." Journal of American Folklore 106 (1993): 38-60.

Moran, Anthony. "Imagining the Australian-Nation: Settler Nationalism and Aboriginality." Diss. Melbourne, 1999.

Nakada Naohisa 中田直久. 《殺身成仁通事吳鳳》.

Ni Zanyuan 倪贊元. 《雲林縣采訪冊》. 1894. In Li Yiyuan.

On Mount Hehuan 合歡山上 (film). Zhongzhi 中制, 1958.

Oshana, Maryann. "Native Women in Westerns: Reality and Myth. Frontiers: A Journal of Women's Studies 6.3 (Autumn 1981): 46-50.

"Portraits of the Human Realm: Ode to Ignorant Mountain Maidens" 人間詩畫: 永無知山姑. China Times 19 May 1956.

Ricoeur, Paul. Time and Narrative (3 vol.). Trans. Kathleen Blamey and David Pellauer. University of Chicago Press, 1984 -1988.

Rite of Winter 冬之祭 (film). 1991.

Satō Haruo 佐藤春夫. "Musha" [Wushe], 1920.

Shi Zhengfeng 施正鋒. 〈原住民政策的定位〉. 2005.

Simon, Scott. "The Underside of a Miracle: Industrialization, Land, and Taiwan's Indigenous Peoples." Cultural Survival Quarterly, 26.2 (May 31, 2002). 13 May 2008 <http://www.cs.org/publications/csq/csq-article.cfm?id=1557>

Sommet, Doris. Foundational Fictions: The National Romances of Latin America. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993.

Song of Mount Chatian 插天山之歌 (film). 2006.

Song of Orchid Island 蘭嶼之歌 (film). Shaw Brothers, 1965.

Song of the Spirits 心靈之歌 (film). 2006.

Song Zelai. "Sea and Shore" 海與大地. 《小說新潮》 3 (Dec. 1977).

Stainton, Michael. "The Politics of Taiwan Aboriginal Origins." In Taiwan: A New History, Murray A. Rubinstein, ed. New York: M. E. Sharpe, Inc., 1999. 27-44.

Stainton, Michael. "Presbyterians and the Aboriginal Revitalization Movement in Taiwan." Cultural Survival Quarterly (26.2). 13 May 2008 <http://www.cs.org/publications/csq/csq-article.cfm?id=1556>

Storm Over Alishan 阿里山風雲 (film). Wanxiang 萬象, 1949.

Super Citizen 超級公民 (film). Wanren 萬仁, 1999.

Teng, Emma. Taiwan's Imagined Geography: Chinese Colonial Travel Writing and Pictures, 1683-1895. Harvard University Press, 2004.

The Heroic Pioneers 唐山過台灣 (film). 1986.

The Sage Hunter 山豬·飛鼠·撒可努 (film). 2005.

The Second Spring of Old Mo 老莫的第二個春天 (film). 1984.

Tierney, Robert. "Going Native: Imagining Savages in the Japanese Empire." Diss. Stanford, 2005.

Tilton, Robert S. Pocahontas: the Evolution of an American Narrative. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.

Two Sign Painters 兩個油漆匠 (film). Longxiang 龍祥, 1990.

Waiting for the Flying Fish 等待飛魚 (film). 2006.

Wang Zhenhe 王禎和. Rose, Rose, I Love You 玫瑰玫瑰我愛你. 1984. Trans. Howard Goldblatt. Columbia University Press, 2000.

Wang Zhenhe. "Summer Day" 夏日. Modern Literature 現代文學 (Jul. 1961).

Wang Zhenxun, ed. 王振勳總編. 《苑裡鎮志(下)》. 苗栗: 苗栗縣苑裡鎮公所, 2002.

Watan. "Myth of the Images of Aborigines." May 13 2008 <http://www.taiwanfirstnations.org/watan.html>.

Weber, Eugen. Peasants into Frenchmen: The Modernization of Rural France, 1870-1914. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1976.

Wu Feng: The Christ of the East 吳鳳 (film). Taiwan sheng 台灣省, 1962.

Wu He 舞鶴. Contemplating Abang and Auvini Kadresengan 思索阿邦•卡露斯. Taipei: Maitian, 2002.
Wu He 舞鶴. Remains of Life.

Yang Mu 楊牧. Wu Feng: An Epic in Four Acts 吳鳳—四幕詩劇. Taipei: Hongfan, 1978.

Ye Shitao. Last of the Siraya 西拉雅族的末裔. Taibei: Qianwei, 2000 [1989-1990].

Zhong Zhaozheng 鍾肇政. Song of Mount Chatian 插天山之歌. Taipei: 志文, 1975. (see <http://literature.ihakka.net/hakka/author/zhong_zhao_zheng/com_list.htm>).

Zhu Xining 朱西甯. "Snake House" 蛇屋. In 狼. Taibei: Yinke, 2006 [1963].